International Literature Review on Urban Energy Transitions

UCL – Energy Institute
Dr Xavier Lemaire & Daniel Kerr

Final Draft - November 2014

Contents

Municipal Planning .......................................................................................................................... 2
Municipal Waste and Energy ............................................................................................................ 4
Transport ........................................................................................................................................ 7
Buildings & Energy .......................................................................................................................... 10
Electricity & Peri-Urban Energy ..................................................................................................... 12
References ...................................................................................................................................... 20
**Topic 1 – Municipal Planning**

Particularly in South East Asia, the lack of clearly-defined policy boundaries with regard to national and municipal authorities for urban energy planning has been observed to be a barrier. Identifying the boundaries of urban governance, for example the limits of the remit of sub-national government administrations, as well as municipal authorities, as well as in which areas the national government wishes to retain some level of centralised control, is important for laying the foundation for a more sustainable urban planning process. However, as stated in Friend et al (2014) “the sectoral interests of government departments are often a disincentive to collaborate around shared ‘urban’ issues”. For example, the development of new urban plans in Thailand is mandated to involved several local administrations, but the process has rarely been implemented due to the lack of incentive to coordinate objectives, and therefore potentially constrain a local administration’s potential to urbanise further.

A major problem in developing countries with regard to urban energy planning is a lack of capacity in project implementation and governance of energy projects within the municipal authorities responsible. The interlinking effects between energy concerns and urban development planning have often been overlooked in city development strategies in the developing world. This has been observed in both SE Asia (Todoc 2008) and in Sub-Saharan Africa (Nissing & van Blotting 2010, Borchers, Euston-Brown etc. 2008). Capacity development in municipal authorities, and the empowerment of municipal authorities in implementing energy projects in their local spheres, has been shown to be a key step in implementing sustainable urban energy planning. For example, the implementation of an Energy Integrated Urban Planning (EUIP) methodology has reaped benefits in both Philippine and Vietnamese cities (Todoc 2008). The methodology is designed to be interrelated with other planning sectors, and to generate benefits across society, for the whole population of the city, whilst respecting local conditions (for example demands and constraints). The EUIP methodology comprises of six activities in the production of a strategic urban energy plan:

1. Socioeconomic analysis
2. Energy and environmental analysis
3. Stakeholder analysis
4. Problem analysis
5. Options finding
6. Strategy and action plan definition

The Mexican case for energy/urban transition also highlights the capacity issues faced in urban planning in developing countries. Paez (2010) analysed the planning processes of a number of municipalities in Mexico with regard to the implementation of sustainable energy projects, as well as sustainability concerns in urban planning and development in a post-petroleum urban model. Mexican energy sources, particularly in cities, are heavily biased towards petroleum products, in part due to the country’s indigenous petroleum production capacity. In addition, the constitutional conditions in the country dictate a high degree of centralisation in energy planning, with federal agencies being in majority responsible for planning at all levels. This has constrained the development of an independent capacity in local, state and federal district government organs for sustainable energy planning and urban planning. Critical factors that were found to be missing in terms of urban planning procedures in the majority of cases include legislation to apply bioclimatic criteria in urban planning and legislation to increase urban density, rather than urban dispersion.

Empowering the local authorities (for example, city councils, city development agencies etc.) in a city for the implementation of sustainable urban energy planning has also been shown to be more
effective for the local energy development of a city than relying on top-down, national-scale energy planning. A useful case for this can be found in Roy (2009), focusing on Dhaka, Bangladesh. A combination approach of identifying a conventional strategic framework for the city, as well as a locally-informed model of sustainable urbanisation, was used in order to produce a more locally-informed approach to sustainable urban planning in the city’s communities. Local stakeholder involvement was a key factor in the approach detailed in Roy (2009), particularly in the context of new urban development planning. With Dhaka following the model of a number of developing megacities of having a highly-developed urban core and a distributed catchment area, combined with the local issues of having significant agricultural production in potential expansion areas for the city, integrated land-use planning with stakeholder involvement was identified as a useful tool in order to effectively plan the city’s further expansion. (Roy 2009)

Following on from this, as well as the necessity of involving municipal authorities in the urban planning process, the need for stakeholder and citizen participation has often been overlooked in urban planning in developing countries. Participation has often had little meaning in the planning process, with functions often amounting to little more than announcing decisions to the affected public. Variation within countries is not uncommon in this regard, for example in Indonesia where both open and inclusive process, and tightly-controlled processes in planning are both evident. Indonesia has also traditionally been quite dependent on external consultancy for technical and non-technical inputs, which undermines the development of local planning and policy capacity. (Friend et al 2014)

Stakeholders at all levels can contribute a significant amount to policy development and planning within a developing city. In summary, stakeholders’ roles can include:

- Developing and writing policy for the city (for example, national and municipal governments)
- Enabling project delivery (for example, energy service companies)
- Implementing projects (construction firms etc.)
- Participation in public consultation and service receipt from the city (end-users)
- Enabling knowledge sharing (for example, academic institutions in the city)

Stakeholders must be aware of the effects that constructing and developing policy for the urban area in question can have. Disempowerment of the local populace and municipal government can result in limited buy-in from these representatives, hampering policy roll-out and project delivery. Such activities must be undertaken carefully, with comprehensive review and consultation with affected parties, to avoid this effect.

The constraints on institutional development mentioned above have also been present in African cities and municipalities. For example, in South Africa, widely varying levels of institutional capacity exist, but a number of constraints to implementation are cross-cutting in the sector. Particularly in the South African context, the dominance of the national energy department, as well as the overarching dominance of the national utility ESKOM in the energy planning process, has led to a lack of consideration for the issues in other government departments. In addition, the traditional approach of ESKOM in particular has been to focus on electricity supply and distribution, and with their income dependent on electricity consumption, the diversification of supply sources and ownership, as well as other demand-side factors, are not easily integrated into their strategy. The building of capacity for sustainable energy approaches into all government departments was seen as a key outcome in improving sustainable energy consideration in South Africa’s urban planning.
Financing constraints and a lack of financial independence are also a widespread factor in municipal authorities in developing countries. Inflexibility in procurement procedures, as well as restrictions on market participation for municipal authorities (for example, in emissions trading) can hamper the ability of local governments to effectively participate in energy project financing. This has been shown to be evident in both developing African and South East Asian cities. The financial means of local governments have been a major barrier to project implementation, with industrial development and population movements often outpacing the means of the local authorities to provide sufficient infrastructure. This is evident, for example, in terms of the growing informality of housing in developing cities.

The importance of local involvement has been demonstrated in Sub-Saharan Africa also, particularly in East African countries such as Kenya. Completion rates for projects have been shown to be correlated to the level of stakeholder and beneficiary involvement in the planning process. For example, in the 1999-2002 planning period for Mombasa, projects from the poverty eradication commission for the city far exceeded other projects in terms of successful completion of objectives, through the involvement of stakeholders, notably the actual project beneficiaries (Kithiia & Dowling 2010).

Another recurrent theme in the available literature is the need for a systems-based approach to sustainable urban planning, considering all available factors and their intersections. A successful example of this is Curitiba, Brazil. Through a combination of an efficient transport system and a holistic approach to city planning, numerous benefits have been achieved for the city, including improvements in air quality, the addition of green space, and decreasing traffic congestion. A number of planning processes were used in the achievement of these goals, including land use zoning and the creation of mixed-use zones, and the combination of strategic transport corridors and the encouragement of high-density growth in proximity to these.

**Topic 2 – Municipal Waste and Energy**

**Waste-to-Energy**

One of the most persistent factors associated with the success or failure of waste to energy projects in developing cities is the social acceptability of waste-to-energy measures. This applies to a variety of waste-to-energy technology options, including landfill incineration and municipal waste-to-biogas digesters. Besides the potential usage of landfill gas as an energy resource, collecting this hazardous material is a key factor in waste management in the developing world. Landfill gas explosions are a common risk factor in new landfill projects, and the solubility of contaminants in landfill gas can be a major environmental issue, as noted for example in the conveyance of vinyl chloride compounds into groundwater sources. There have been a number of measures to address this catalogued in the literature, notably in terms of cases in China. Zheng et al (2014) details a wide variety of policy measures to further the development of both incineration and biogas technologies in the country. The 2007 National Programme on Climate Change in China extended the industrialisation of municipal solid waste incineration technologies, and also laid a number of ground rules for the development of new incineration plants to address the concerns of previous projects, including siting new incinerators away from economically developed areas or where land is scarce. Minimum utilisation targets were also set under this plan, incentivising the sustainability improvement of the municipal solid waste management regime.
Economic and environmental sustainability of municipal waste-to-energy projects have been the critical factors in project success or failure in the majority of cases, particularly in South East Asian cases. Economic sustainability is also a key factor in majority of African cases, although the availability of currently-poorly managed municipal waste contributes to the effective economic sustainability of some African projects. (Oteng-Ababio 2013, Kurniawan et al 2013)

The technology options appropriate for waste-to-energy applications in developing countries are often dependent on the prevalent composition of the municipal waste in the relevant context. This dictates a localised and context-specific approach, with a number of cases (for example, Oteng-Ababio 2013 Giza and Cairo cases) demonstrating the dangers of direct technology transfer from Western or more developed contexts.

Sustainable Waste Management

To date there have been a number of barriers identified to the sustainable management of municipal solid waste in African cities. These fall into four main categories:

- Institutional and regulatory barriers
- Natural/physical barriers
- Operational barriers
- Socio-economic barriers

Institutional and regulatory barriers can include policies being poorly focused and lacking strategies for action, as well as a weak regulatory framework. Natural/physical barriers include the ease of availability of dumping grounds, the unplanned nature of a city’s urban form, and the nature of the municipal waste the city produces. Operational barriers mainly focus on the organisations responsible for municipal waste management in the city, including limited scope of operations, poorly-paid and under-skilled staff, and unsuitable/obsolete equipment. Socio-economic barriers include insufficient funding for municipal waste management, a negative public attitude and an unsuitable investment climate for new operations in the sector (Ezeah & Roberts 2012).

Recommendations based on a survey of the above barriers in Abuja, Nigeria (Ezeah & Roberts 2012) focused primarily on the policy and regulatory environment for municipal waste management in the city. Weaknesses in the regulatory environment and the lack of a clear strategy for realisation of waste management policies have damaged the effectiveness of waste management activities in the city. The lack of participation of the private sector in waste management operations has also led to a rise in informal sector operations in the city, which are often unsustainable and can be illegal. Liberalisation of the waste sector and encouraging private sector participation was recommended to improve the sustainability of waste management.

There are, however, cases where top-down operations implemented by a national government or government agency have resulted in significant improvements in the sustainability of waste management operations. For example, Malaysian projects involving incineration of municipal solid waste and refuse-derived fuel projects have proven reasonably successful, for example the RDF pilot plant in Sermenyih, Selangor (Kadir et al 2013). However, there have remained significant challenges to the construction of larger-scale waste-to-energy projects in Malaysia. According to Kadir et al (2013) these include: ‘health risks associated with the emissions of toxic organic compounds and metals from stack, complications caused by disposal of inorganic residue and difficulty of monitoring facilities after the preliminary test burns have been conducted’.
Notably in African cities, there exists a persistent disconnection between formal waste management services and the operations conducted by the informal sector. A number of cases in West Africa (for example, Nigeria and Ghana) have shown the limitations of a centralised state operator model, with this position being incompatible with the socio-economic and physical realities of the country contexts. A lack of local capacity and insufficient financial investment has heightened the need for alternative approaches, at a more local scale and taking the specific context of the waste regime into account. Notably in Ghanaian cities, for example the capital Accra, informal waste collection services have performed better than the municipal authorities in areas with high population densities and a non-conducive spatial layout. A study of a number of varying-income areas of Accra discovered that upwards of 60% of respondents in middle-income areas used the services of informal-sector waste operations. The continued existence of the informal sector in waste management services in developing cities, despite often hostile regulatory environments and competition from public and private entities, denotes a gap in services that has not been addressed by the public and private sectors. Therefore, the integration of informal and formal sectors can lead to a more sustainable waste management regime. Oteng-Ababio et al (2013) offers a wide array of case studies of successful and unsuccessful efforts to integrate the informal and formal waste service sectors, covering a number of developing country contexts.

Key features of the successful case studies include:

- Organisation of the informal sector actors into a formalised entity, for example a union or trade organisation. A successful case of this was in Belo Horizonte, Brazil, with the formation of the Waste Picker’s Association (ASMARE). The formation of the association and its integration into the city’s formal waste management activities in 1993 guaranteed the informal sector workers rights to work in the city, and access to suitable facilities to more effectively operate.

- Organisation of informal workers’ cooperatives to more effectively service under-serviced communities, for example low-income and informal settlements. In Mozambique, the capital Maputo’s municipal authorities embarked on a joint project with GIZ (then GTZ) to improve waste collection, recovery and disposal. The organisation of the city’s informal sector waste workers into cooperatives with the support of the programme increased the efficiency of their activities, and a higher standard of waste service was provided to the areas previously serviced by the informal sector operators. 45% of the low-income areas of the city had coverage by municipal collection services at the end of the program, with employment provided for over 250 workers.

- Lack of recognition for informal sector activities and the relationship between this and unsustainable waste management practices. An example of this in in Egypt, where the effectiveness of informal sector municipal waste workers was not considered in the reforms of the Cairo and Giza municipal waste collection systems in the 1990s. Contracts were awarded to multinational corporations, and a transfer of standard Western waste management technology and policy options was branded a failure, with companies regularly failing to meet a recycling quota of 20%, compared to the 70-80% achieved by the informal sector operations.

- Accessing organic waste to operate landfill gas-to-electricity projects. Both California and South Africa have experienced issues with accessing landfill gas for different reasons. Legislative difficulties in the Californian Energy Act of 1994 prohibit the distribution of landfill gas via pipeline off-site, meaning all generation from landfill gas has to be performed on-site, often increasing costs and hampering efficiency. Illegal dumping/littering affecting the volumes of landfill waste has been a problem for a number of South African
municipalities in the sector, for example Ethekwini (formally Durban) municipality. These illegal or unregulated activities affect the amount of landfilled waste in the municipality, and therefore the amount of landfill gas produced.

**Topic 3 – Transport**

Sustainability in urban transportation covers a wide variety of measures and technologies. Some broad categories can be determined from the wide-ranging case studies available in the literature. Mass-transit approaches are a common policy and technology mechanism used to promote sustainable urban transport, covering both rapid-transit routes as well as strengthening municipal transport links. The promotion of alternative fuel use is another broad theme in the sphere of sustainable transport, particularly in biofuel use, with a number of examples in Brazilian cities, as well as some Sub-Saharan African cases (da Silva, Costa & Brondino (2007), da Silva, da Silva Costa & Macedo (2008)). An integrated approach has proven to be the most useful in a number of case studies in the literature, with aggregated approach papers such as Bräuninger et al (2012) encompassing a wide variety of integrated and specific approaches.

Another point highlighted consistently in the literature is the synergy between transportation planning and urban land use planning in developing cities. These synergies both in considering the existing urban land use pattern, and in urban design for future land use and transport. Bräuninger et al (2012) highlights a best practice case of Curitiba, in Brazil. From the 1960s onwards, Curitiba has been implementing an integrated transport city plan, with the city’s first bus rapid transit line opening in 1974. Curitiba’s city planners saw transport as the backbone of growth for the city, and as such also acquired strategic land before it was developed, providing city-subsidised housing for low-income communities, with already integrated transport links to the main economic zones. Residential and commercial zoning in the city has enabled policies such as parking restrictions in the downtown area to be implemented effectively, encouraging public transport use, and enabling the pedestrianisation of areas of the city centre.

Curitiba’s bus rapid transit system is a widely-studied successful case in its own right. The system comprised of 340 routes, with a total network length of 1,100 km as of 2012. Five key urban corridors are complemented by orbital bus routes and feeder routes, maximising accessibility across the city. Advantages to this approach in general include the relatively low infrastructure costs compared to other mass transit measures, as well as flexibility in responding to development. Concentrating development along already existing bus corridors can help to generate travel demand for the system. Operating costs can be further reduced by competitively tendering routes, as is used in the Curitiba case. With a tendering public authority bearing the risk for revenues, effective regulation of fares to achieve the desired social and economic goals of the system is also simplified. The Curitiba system also operates a ‘one journey, one ticket’ system, with one flat fare required for a journey, regardless of distance or transfers. The design of the system optimising the interchanges between feeder and trunk services, enabling the system to function more effectively. Finally, the municipal authority retains control of fare pricing, enabling the authority to keep fares within the reach of the poorest users.

The context of an urban transport system is widely observed to be the critical factor in designing appropriate responses to the issue of transport sustainability. Godard (2013) compares West and North African transport systems, and observes that whilst similarities exist in the varying country contexts, significant structural differences mean bespoke responses will ultimately achieve greater
success than a cross-cutting strategy. North African mass transit systems have provided positive experiences in the sector in recent years, including light rail transit systems in Tunis, as well as tram-based systems in Moroccan and Algerian cities. By contrast, West African (and Sub-Saharan African more generally) experiences in mass transit are limited, with a number of projects envisaged, but few coming to bear. The lack of appropriate institutional arrangements before projects commencing, as well as financial constraints, were determined to be the main constraining factors in the region.

Godard (2013) goes on to note the importance of the paratransit sector in considering the urban transport system of many African cities. Paratransit use has been the dominant public/collective mode of transport in a number of West African cities (with, for example, a 56% share in Yaoundé in 2010), covering modes such as minibuses, shared taxis and motorcycle taxis. The sector is characterised by the driver retaining operational responsibility for the vehicle, and paying a rental (mostly daily rentals) to the owner of the vehicle, keeping the surplus in fares as revenue.

The paratransit sector in many cities is subject to minimum regulation, with public authorities only intervening in terms of licenses and taxes. The sector is in general self-organised, and attempts at further regulating the paratransit sector are not numerous. Godard (2013) uses a case study of Dakar, Senegal, which experienced a World Bank-funded program of minibus fleet renewal from 2005 onwards. The principle was to introduce regulatory measures which minibus operators could accept to benefit from financial facilities for the vehicle renewal. These include ticket systems for payments, rather than direct payments to controllers, and wages for drivers and controllers instead of direct payments from fare receipts.

Some outcomes from the Dakar World Bank program were the improvement of service, which was determined to be the result of improved operations rather than the vehicle renewal itself. Financial sustainability for the project was indirectly improved through the compensation payment for scrapped vehicles scheme in the city at the time, and Godard draws from this the necessity of direct or indirect subsidies in modernisation of paratransit. Another point highlighted is the lack of urgency in local authorities in adapting to the rapid evolution of the transport sector in general, and the paratransit sector in particular. This has been observed in other cases, such as in Morocco, where reorganisation and modernisation of the sector has been a very gradual process.

Another case study on the interactions between existing paratransit networks and new transportation schemes, particularly bus rapid transit, can be found in Schalekamp & Behrens (2010). Considering the case of South Africa, where a number of cities were/are planning integrated transport networks relying on the introduction of bus rapid transit, these reforms were also used as a mechanism for the reform of the paratransit sector, dominant in terms of market share, but unregulated. National, regional and local paratransit groups objected to the proposed reforms, on the grounds of insufficient consultation and unclear roles in the new system, as well as concerns about redundancies. The paper highlights the importance of stakeholder consultation in new transport system planning; with the lack of consultation and expectation from municipal authorities that paratransit operators would be formalised and incorporated readily into scheduled public transport services, the paratransit sector was unwilling to cooperate with the goals of the municipal authority.

The paper goes on to explore alternative approaches to engaging the paratransit sector in transport reform processes. Using a case study of initiatives underway as of 2010 in the Nelson Mandela Metropole and Cape Town, one recommendation is for paratransit to be part of a wide diversity of public transport initiatives in an urban area, with paratransit operators and bus rapid transit systems operating at different ends of an integrated business. The aforementioned municipalities have plans
to stagger the implementation of bus rapid transit into an initial pilot phase, servicing the main urban corridors, which is then able to be used as leverage for the remaining incumbent operators to join a more wide-ranging implementation of the system. Stepped transitions to bus rapid transit integration and paratransit formalisation are also suggested as a means to assist in paratransit sector integration, initially by formalising the paratransit sector, then transitioning to an integrated operating company model, incorporating bus rapid transit services.

The importance of stakeholder engagement in delivering new public transport services is another recurring theme in the literature. This applies across all levels, from underserved communities and other users to paratransit operators to existing mass transit companies. Ibitayo (2010) highlights the importance of community consultation in the viability and sustainability of urban transport services for Lagos, Nigeria, focusing on commuter opinions and experiences. Dirgahayani & Nakamura (2012) also highlights the importance of user consultation in mass transit system design, using a Japanese and Indonesian city as case studies. Horizontal coordination among local stakeholders, for example by achieving coordination among transportation sub-systems (traffic, public transport, road network etc.) is shown to be a determining factor in the effectiveness of an urban transport system, and in the case of Matsuyama, the Japanese city studied, partnerships between local government, operators and citizenry in terms of discussion led to improved service quality and satisfaction.

The implementation of sustainable urban transport strategies is ultimately influenced by the form of the urban area in which the strategies exist. A significant number of factors in terms of urban form affect the development of sustainable transport strategies, including the siting of new residential and commercial areas and the transport links between them, the placement of existing urban zones and the morphology of existing urban sprawl, and the form of the existing road network and its current status.

A particular case highlighting the transport challenges of dealing with unregulated urban expansion is in Olvera, Plat & Pochet (2013), considering the case of Dar es Salaam. Significant demographic growth from the late 1960s onwards, coupled with a lack of urban planning and high informality, led to large increases in the urban area of the city, with the maximum distance from city centre to city edge increasing by over 20km from the mid-1970s to the early 2000s. The radial structure of the existing road network, in conjunction with the concentration of jobs and urban facilities in the central business district, and wide, unplanned dispersion of residential zones, lead to increased pressures on the public transportation of the city.

The growth of unplanned settlements in Dar es Salaam has also pressurised the urban transport system and services, and the lack of capacity in transport services to adequately supply unplanned urban settlements in the city has contributed to economic and social polarisation of these communities.

Zhou et al (2013) also investigates the relationship between settlement morphology and transportation energy consumption, using Xiamen Island, China as a case study. Housing policy in China over the last 30 years, in combination with the rapid urbanisation of the island, have greatly contributed to increases in transport energy consumption for the island’s residents. Using the TRANUS integrated land-use/transport model, separating demand and supply elements and defining activities that require transport, as well as transport options and accessibility, the paper proposes options for reducing both the transport energy consumption and CO2 emissions of the island. These scenarios are centred on the transition from older urban village settlements to newer commercial developments, with appropriate policy support, for example in giving priority to public transport.
development, and in integrated road construction and planning, in a four-stage network system to increase capacity and free flow of traffic.

The implementation of municipal government policy relating to transport in the Xiamen Island case is key to achieving the goals of the transport system transition. Without appropriate policy support in the form described above, both gasoline consumption and CO2 emissions were projected to be higher than a business-as-usual scenario, due to a greatly increased rate of private car use in the traffic make-up of the system. (Zhou et al 2013).

**Topic 4 – Buildings and Energy**

The broad spectrum of measures to address energy concerns in buildings in urban areas of developing countries can be split predominantly into measures affecting construction and planning of buildings, and demand-side measures affecting the users of buildings. Sustainable construction and operation of buildings, the carbon content of buildings materials in new and existing buildings, thermal energy performance of buildings and planning for new and existing construction in terms of densification and energy consumption patterns of residents have all been identified in the literature as factors affecting the overall energy consumption attributable to buildings (Jiang et al (chair), 2009, Heravi & Qaemi, 2014, Kadian, Dahiya & Garg, 2007).

Demand-side measures examined in the literature include improved energy efficiency of appliance stock, as well as the importance of user behaviour on building energy performance (Ouyang & Hokao 2009), covering energy efficiency gains from changes in personal behaviour, and energy consumption patterns in different housing types. The behavioural analysis measures have also been shown to be cross-applicable over differing country contexts, and within different regions of the same country (Ofori, 2007).

Another distinction in the literature exists in the separation of measures addressing the energy efficiency of buildings and measures addressing the carbon production and content of buildings and buildings materials. Carbon reduction measures and measures that address energy efficiency are not necessarily cross-applicable in terms of strategy and policy development (Koizumi, 2007, UN-HABITAT, 2010).

The relationship between urban form and building energy consumption, as well as carbon emissions, is also determined to have a significant effect. Qin & Han (2013) for example examines evidence from Beijing, China, on the relationship between planning parameters; for example population density, land use, accessibility to public transport, and balance between jobs and housing, and household carbon emissions. The paper analyses 1,227 households in three high-carbon and two low-carbon neighbourhoods in the city, determining a number of conclusions based on these planning parameters. Higher building density areas in the city generally used less energy for cooling and heating per building area, and the study also noted the association with greater use of low-carbon transport modes, for example public transport, of high building density areas. The paper goes on to note the association between transport energy consumption and land use planning, with mixed land-use areas shortening commuting distances, increasing the employment/population ratio and balancing the jobs/housing mix. Better access to employment locations resulting from mixed-use zoning can also help to reduce carbon emissions, through reducing transport carbon emissions. This paper highlights again the interconnected nature of urban planning and strategy, with building
planning affecting transport energy consumption, as well as affecting the energy end-use patterns of behaviour of building users.

Mandatory energy efficiency codes for new buildings can assist in reducing building stock energy consumption and carbon production. Liu, Meyer & Hogan (World Bank/ESMAP, 2010) provides a number of case studies on early adopters of building energy efficiency codes in developing countries, and also goes into detail on strategies for mainstreaming building energy efficiency codes, and global cooperation and knowledge exchange to achieve this. Studying China, India, Mexico and Egypt as examples, the paper summarises the four programs, noting the successful and unsuccessful examples among them. Experiences from the programs are separated into key conditions for the successful implementation of energy efficiency codes. These include political commitment to energy efficiency, suitable incentives for efficiency, government oversight and regulation of the construction sector, compliance capacity of the supply chain for energy efficient materials, and financing mechanisms for energy efficiency improvements. Finally, a key lesson that the paper highlights is the importance of setting incremental targets for energy efficiency program implementation in buildings, starting with realistic goals, and consciously taking note of compliance cost and the effect on the construction sector and market of the program.

Liu, Meyer & Hogan (World Bank/ESMAP, 2010) goes on to detail international assistance strategies for mainstreaming building energy efficiency codes in developing countries, most notably in terms of financing and supporting the effectiveness of regulation and oversight in government. Incremental cost financing, and bridging the gap in financing common in low and lower-middle income countries, is noted to be a critical issue, with the authors recommending targeting market segments where economic benefits are greatest, and enforcement is most likely to be effective. The paper also recommends knowledge exchange in terms of policy assistance for developing countries, streamlining building law and permitting process, as well as strengthening compliance and enforcement infrastructure for building energy efficiency, for example by involving nongovernmental entities for regulatory processes.

Thermal energy consumption in the developing world has been significantly affected by the rapid urbanisation experienced in many countries. Barnes, Krutilla & Hyde (2004) examines the urban household energy transition, characterising it with a typology of energy usage. The pattern begins with high woodfuel utilisation, through the use of “transition” fuels such as kerosene or charcoal, to implementing LPG and electricity usage for household energy needs. The paper examines Hyderabad’s urban transition as a case study, particularly policy mechanisms that affected the transition to modern fuels the urban population has undergone. In particular, subsidies for fuel purchasing for poorer communities led to increased use of LPG in households, through government-operated networks, which in turn led the fuel-wood sector, operating on market principles and largely unregulated, to replace its residential customer base with commercial customers, supplanting low-quality coal as their fuel of choice.

Subsidy mechanisms are an important factor in targeting energy transitions for the poorest consumers, moving away from so-called “traditional” fuels to modern energy services, however the paper also identifies the need to carefully target these subsidies to benefit the poorest. For example in the Hyderabad case, higher-income groups were receiving the majority of the subsidy expenditure by the government, due to the targeting of subsidies directly at the price of LPG and electricity, leading larger consumers to benefit greater from the reductions. In addition, the targeting of subsidies across modern and transition forms of energy was not optimal for reaching poorest consumers, who only benefitted to a great extent from the kerosene subsidies.
The household energy transition is a recurring theme across the literature, particularly the concept of the “energy services ladder”, where households’ currently utilising traditional energy sources such as fuel-wood transition to more modern energy services, such as LPG and kerosene, through transition fuels, higher in quality than traditional fuel choices, such as charcoal. Sovacool (2010) examines the concept in detail, dividing household energy services into lower, middle, and upper income brackets, and also differentiating energy carriers from energy services, defining services as “benefits that energy carriers produce for human wellbeing”. Lower income households are characterised by greater numbers of fuels and carriers, but fewer numbers of services, with middle and upper income households utilising a much broader range of energy services. The author concludes that examining fuel choice in terms of energy services leads to a potential reorientation of priorities for household energy policy, focusing less on raw energy carrier amounts and provision, and more on the services that energy can provide (lighting, heating, cooking etc.).

Rapid urbanisation in developing countries is also changing the makeup of household energy consumption within countries, with a growing disparity being observed between rural and urban areas. Miah et al (2011) for example examines this effect in Bangladesh, noting clear differences in household fuel consumption between rural and peri-urban areas, with rural areas dependant on fuel-wood and other biomass sources, and peri-urban areas having a more diversified energy mix including electricity more often. The key determining factor in the Bangladeshi case in determining household fuel usage was disposable income of the households, with increases in disposable income being linked to improvements in efficiency and sustainability of fuel choices. Other factors included family size, dwelling type and size, and educational status. The authors derive policy recommendations from these conclusions also, suggesting a diversification of priorities for energy policy to focus on the individual needs of economic groups in the country.

In terms of demand-side measures, appliances are a common theme across the literature to target for energy efficiency improvements. Particularly in warm climates, air conditioning units are a significant contributor to urban energy consumption. Koizumi et al (2010) for example examines the role that the Clean Development Mechanism can play in promoting improved energy efficiency of air conditioners in developing countries. The paper notes for example a difference in average energy efficiency levels in countries with indigenous production capacity compared to those that don’t, using case studies of China and Ghana respectively. The sets of barriers to improved energy efficiency in these differing contexts were also determined to lie in different areas. Countries with indigenous air conditioner production capacity were more likely to suffer from financial and business management barriers, whereas countries which import air conditioning units are more likely to suffer from policy and information technology barriers in the diffusion of efficient air conditioners. For example, in the case of Ghana, the potential for efficient air conditioning has largely not been realised, due to a lack of capacity in many government agencies (for example, customs officials), as well as in importers, distributors and consumers to identify the benefits of efficient equipment.

**Topic 5 – Electricity and Peri-Urban Energy**

1. What has been written until now on the topic?

On which countries? Which continents?

A significant number of papers and articles have been written on the peri-urban situation in Africa, in particular South Africa and East African countries such as Tanzania and Kenya (Scott, Dunn & Sugden 2003; Gaunt et al 2012; Parsa et al 2011, Marais & Ntema 2013, Visagie 2008, Menshawy, Ali
& Salman 2012). However, the current body of literature covers a wide range of both countries and continents, including South America (World Bank/ESMAP 2008; Bravo, Kozulj & Landaveri 2008), India (World Bank/ESMAP 2008; Dhingra et al 2008) and South East Asia, particularly Thailand (Winayanti & Lang 2004; Asian Institute of Technology 2008; Shrestha et al 2008, Hossain 2012).

What has been written focusing on slums, townships / focusing on the poorest? Or informal settlement in general? Other non-electrified areas (including middle-class)

A large proportion of the literature found for this review focuses on “slums”, as a distinct sub-class of “informal settlements” (Scott, Dunn & Sugden 2003; Asian Institute of Technology 2008). These items most often focus on the poorest segment of the communities they are found in (World Bank/ESMAP 2008), and in majority focus on the Indian sub-continent and South East Asia (Winayanti & Lang 2004; Asian Institute of Technology 2008). The majority of papers that use the “informal settlements” definition tend to focus on relatively more-established households and communities, although still on an informal, and often illegal basis (Mimi & Ecer 2010; Gaunt et al 2008; Parsa et al 2011). The difference in the use of the two terms does not appear to be clearly defined, although clear geographical boundaries in terminology use exist (“slum” most commonly used for India/Bangladesh/Thailand, “informal settlement” for sub-Saharan Africa, Brazil, Colombia etc.).

2. How do municipalities proceed to electrify informal settlements? Non-electrified places?

What is the approach toward illegal connections?

There are two primary approaches adopted by municipalities when considering the electrification of informal settlements with the electricity utility carrying out the connections: a blanket electrification approach, where all households in the target area are electrified, or a selective electrification approach, where households are connected only once they’ve paid a connection fee. The blanket approach generally uses an alternative mechanism to recover the electrification fee after the fact.

The selective approach has some disadvantages, particularly in terms of illegal connections. Under the selective electrification model, there are no disincentives towards continuing to use an illegal electricity connection, which perpetuates the safety concerns, loss in revenue for the utility, and necessity for regular policing and disconnection that entails. Particularly in South Africa, where both models have been operated at various stages, the poorest are often the slowest to acquire formal electricity connections, and there is little incentive to move away from free, if unsafe and unreliable, illegal connections.

The blanket electrification approach, in South Africa, has been shown to reduce substantially, if not half, illegal connections. This approach also reduces the costs of making multiple visits to connect households separately. Connection fees are most commonly nominal under this method, with connection costs ranging from R8,000 – 12,000 (£443 – 670), and normal fees in the region of a few hundred rand. Prepayment meters as used in South Africa allow the distribution companies to recover connection fees over a period of time until the fee is paid. (Gaunt et al 2008, Visagie 2008).

Many electricity utilities tend to see poor households as a problem, and not as potential clients. A standard approach, when faced with the loss of revenue through illegal connections, is to remove the connections instead of developing innovative methods to increase their client base. The switch to electricity from traditional fuels for many of the poorest households is hindered by high connection and standing charges, and high equipment costs, for example with wiring. Utilities are
often reluctant to provide a new electricity connection, or electricity services more generally, to areas where there is doubt about the legal tenure of properties, and where the dwellings are not considered to be a formal construction. This has been noted to be the case in Brazil previously (Droege (ed) 2008).

The formalisation of illegal electricity connections through grid extension and formal metering has also been seen to work in Argentina. Prepayment systems have been introduced by utilities such as Edenor, using a system similar to a pay-as-you-go mobile phone, with a single-use printed code distributed by vouchers at local stores, ensuring easy access. In the trial areas of Buenos Aires where Edenor piloted this model, ninety percent of respondents (from a base of 150) reported that they appreciated the utility’s policy of converting illegal electricity connections into legal ones with the provision of a pre-paid electricity meter. Similar positive experiences with slot meters have been found in Nigeria, where it was determined that regular meters led to irregular payments, hence the introduction of slot meters for poorer households, or those with new electricity connections, at the same rate for regular meters. (Droege (ed) 2008). Formalisation of property rights and the provision of basic urban services (water and electricity) has also been a part of the settlement upgrading process in a number of south-eastern European countries, for example Albania and Greece (Potsiou, 2014).

What is the approach toward informal settlements?

A number of informal settlement electrification programs have been undertaken to date through central government programs, as well as through government partnering with private organisations. For example, slum electrification programs were included in the Brazilian government’s utility upgrade program for Rio de Janeiro, with the main electricity provider in the city, Light Servicios de Electricidad SA, offering a 42% discount on meter installation for low-income residents in favela areas, with an additional option for payment to be carried out through 24 separate US$3 instalments (Scott, Dunn & Sugden 2003).

Particularly in South Africa, in part due to the prevailing political landscape there through the Free Basic Electricity Allowance and policies such as the Guidelines for the Electrification of Unproclaimed Areas, informal settlement electrification has been high on the list of political priorities. This is usually achieved through grid extension to the unelectrified settlement. However, the issue of illegal electricity connections is still a persistent one. ESKOM (the national utility) has also previously received criticism for the unsustainability of its electrification program, due to the very fact it was electrifying “unproclaimed” areas. However, with the Guidelines for the Electrification of Unproclaimed Areas, illegal settlements acquired a measure of permanence in the eyes of the law, and were able to apply for grid connection in the manner of a formal settlement. The Free Basic Electricity tariffs also do not have an immediate impact on the very poor, as they are not electrified, and subsidy leakage has been identified as a key issue in the program. The South African approach to date has involved thorough community engagement pre-electrification, and flexibility in the regulation of, and technical options for, the provision of grid electricity to the settlement. (Gaunt et al 2008, Bekker et al 2008)

In India, the most common (and dominant) method for electrifying new households is through grid extension, particularly in urban and peri-urban areas. However, as is common in Indian cities across most federal regions, the illegality of slum communities in the eyes of the municipal authorities was a key barrier to legal electricity access. A legacy of mistrust between the communities and utility companies due to the prevalent illegal connections also hindered formalisation of access. In Delhi, the Bhalla Factory slum was assisted in overcoming these barriers by a Delhi-based NGO, the
The NGO liaised with both the municipal electricity authorities and the Mihila Housing Trust to arrange microfinance for residents of the slum, and ensure timely repayment of the loans, in order that the community could better afford the high up-front costs of grid connection, and assure the utility of the measure of the community’s financial and physical stability. (World Bank/ESMAP 2008).

3. Who is involved?

In South Asia, particularly in India, the research into unelectrified communities, informal settlement electricity usage and illegal connections is predominantly done by the electricity utility responsible for the surrounding area or the national/state utility where relevant. Utilities are particularly responsible for the majority of data relating to illegal electricity connections in slum communities, both in terms of non-technical electricity losses and lost revenue. In India particularly, the process between utility and consumer can be a two-way one, with NGOs often acting as intermediaries between co-operatives and informal settlement community groups (World Bank/ESMAP 2008, Shrestha 2008).

In common with the experience seen in India/South Asia, municipal electricity distributors are the main organisations responsible for the majority of research into informal settlement electrification in South Africa. This is evident both in the approach taken to electrifying a settlement, and in the technical options available to the distributor (Gaunt et al 2008, Visagie 2008). In Senegal, also, the main body responsible for research into peri-urban electrification is SENELEC, that national utility, although this is not their specific aim: for example, the utility considers the entire Dakar region to be “urban” under their designations, making no distinction between the formal and informal settlements present (Fall et al 2008).

The South American experience appears to be distinct from this, with local and national governments being more involved in the research and decision-making process alike for peri-urban electrification. For example, in Argentina, the national energy policies relating to the poorest sectors of society have included regularisation of electricity users in the Greater Buenos Aires region using an illegal connection. In addition, the development of a “social tariff” for the poorest electricity users in conjunction with EDENOR, a Buenos Aires distribution company, has been undertaken. Government involvement in informal settlement electrification is common in Brazil also, where the national government has been involved through the national energy policy in the provision of energy to, and regularisation of supply to, informal settlements in the country (Bravo, Kozulj & Landaveri 2008, Mimmi & Ecer 2010).

In terms of the decision-making process for choosing informal settlements to electrify, utilities often have the final say. This arises from the need for the utility to provide a viable electricity service to the informal settlement, and recover its costs. Decision-making in terms of electricity pricing policy for informal settlement connections also rests solely with the utility in the majority of cases (Gaunt et al 2008, Asian Institute of Technology 2008, Shrestha et al 2008).

A number of cases, particularly in India and South Asia more widely, suggest some collaborative decision-making power with NGOs and community groups, with NGOs often being involved in initial liaison activities and project management with utilities/municipal governments to secure formal electricity connections for the community. Community organisation to lobby for improved services is a particularly common theme in Indian peri-urban electrification to date, for example with the
collaboration between the INDCARE NGO and the Bhalla Factory community groups previously mentioned in Delhi. (World Bank/ESMAP 2008, Fall et al 2008)

The South American experience is that of governments, both local and national, being more involved with the decision-making for slum electrification. This is achieved through policy mechanisms, as well as partnering with electricity utilities in order to electrify and regularise connections in slum communities. Local government organisations are also a key player in Indian peri-urban electrification, as a key precursor to a formal electricity connection in the country is formal property rights, which are regulated by the municipal government. In South East Asia, government policy has been traditionally more focused on land use, rather than direct electricity policies for informal settlement (Lusugga & Kironde 2006). However, the Thai government has instituted electricity tariffs in order to assist the poorest consumers, with a “reduced tariff” for monthly consumers up to 150 kWh being available (Bravo, Kozulj & Landaveri 2008, Shrestha et al 2008, Dhingra et al 2008).

4. What are the criteria to select an area to be electrified?

In South Africa, the government classifies informal settlements for electrification purposes into three categories based on the suitability of the land they occupy for habitation and the projected permanence of the settlement. Category 3 settlements are those on unsuitable land (such as in dangerous or toxic/otherwise unsafe areas) which need relocation. These are the least likely to be electrified, although well-established Category 3 settlements are considered by the DoE on a case-by-case basis. Category 2 settlements are those not in need of immediate relocation, and are eligible for electrification subsidies if they are not relocated within 3 years of initial assessment. Category 1 settlements are those on suitable land, and likely to go through in-situ formalisation and upgrading, and are immediately eligible for electrification subsidies. The definition of a slum community has also been an important, if non-transparent, factor in the selection for “upgrading” activities undertaken by Egyptian municipal authorities (Gaunt et al 2008, Menshawy, Ali & Salman 2011).

In Mumbai, India, the Maharashtra state government policy on informal residences was that without legal recognition or proof of residence, public services (such as electricity) cannot be provided to a household. This has led to slum dwellers (often referred to as “pavement dwellers”, living in temporary shacks along the city’s roads) utilising illegal and unsafe electricity connections, resorting often to acquiring night-time electricity from middle men. Concerns raised by the Bombay Electricity Supply and Transport Undertaking (BEST), the city utility, included the demolition threat of informal settlements, leading to infrastructure losses, and the violation of their own rules that households without proof of tenure should not be supplied with electricity.

This complex situation was eventually resolved to a degree through the participation of the slum dwellers in organisation activities, in a structured manner to demand and acquire electricity access. Members of Mahila Milan, a women’s self-help group, initially negotiated with the BEST, and through collaboration with community-based organisations and NGOs, were able to agree that legal electricity direct from the BEST would be a safer, more reliable and affordable approach to electricity access. This is a clear example of how community organisation can affect the political standpoint of a government body, as this led to BEST changing its policy for electricity supply for urban poor populations, specifically “pavement dwellers”, recognising their entitlement to electricity service, as the inhabitants recognised the need to organise themselves as a group and comply with the service provider’s preconditions. This model has been successfully replicated in other slum areas of Indian cities, also, as well as influencing the Mumbai Municipal Corporation to introduce a new initiative to
reduce the need for “No Objection Certificates” to be issued for other municipal services (water/sanitation etc.) for informal settlements. (World Bank/ESMAP 2008).

In Thailand, a new electricity connection cannot be authorised without the presence of a household registration document, compulsory household registration was introduced in 1956. Popular campaigns for better recognition of the urban poor led to the Thai government beginning to issue temporary registration numbers or “quasi-household IDs” around 1995. These quasi-household registrations allow the household to apply for a legal electricity connection with the relevant utility, albeit at a higher deposit level than for fully registered households. The responsibility for applying for the connection still lies with the resident, rather than the utility blanket- or selectively-connecting an area under this system. (Shrestha et al 2008).

Political factors must also be considered in understanding the selection of communities for electrification. For example, it has been noted in Senegal that the political influence and local community lobbying ability to the national utility and the government affects the ability of the community to obtain electricity. Peri-urban zones in Dakar that host important religious families, or some traditional chiefs, are more readily electrified (for example, the Yoff Layene area of the city) (Fall et al 2008, Marais & Ntema 2013).

Political factors have also been seen to have a significant effect in the electrification of the bosti (informal settlements) of Dhaka, Bangladesh. Liaison with the Dhaka Electricity Supply Company to negotiate a legal electricity connection has in many cases been limited to participants in the bosti local somiti, or savings club, with those who refuse to participate/have been forced out of participation through discriminatory requirements for joining the somiti, still being forced to resort to illegal connections through neighbours, due to the prohibitive connection costs experienced in the city. Patronage and corruption within both the somiti, the settlement’s governing committee (where all settlement members are encouraged and allowed to participate) and the Dhaka Electricity Supply Company, led to problems when the informal regulation that had existed prior to the central government’s “fight corruption” plan tried to be formalised, leading to a crackdown on illegal connections (some of which had been negotiated with other bosti by the somiti), and a corresponding erasure of regulatory “space” for the informal settlements of the city (Hossain 2012).

5. What are lessons drawn?

There are a number of conclusions to be drawn from the experiences detailed in the literature to date. Firstly, the most common barrier observed to electricity access for informal peri-urban communities is their lack of formal land tenure. The commonality of approach by utilities in requiring a formal right of settlement to inhabited land before providing a formal electricity connection has prohibited many communities from gaining access to legal electricity (World Bank/ESMAP 2008, Fall et al 2008, Gaunt et al 2008). It has also been shown that when these requirements are waived, and/or the informal settlements are formalised by the relevant authorities (municipal governments and housing associations, for example), illegal connections and electricity thefts have decreased (Shrestha et al 2008, Parsa et al 2008, Menshawy, Ali & Salman 2011).

Secondly, tailoring the method used to collect payment for installation of equipment and electricity services to the ability to pay of the community leads to more effective service, and a reduction in electricity thefts. This can be achieved for example by not collecting up-front installation costs, and rather spreading the payment over a longer period (6 months) via the electricity meter/bill. Pre-
payment electricity meters have also proven to be superior to standard meters for poor communities, as it allows a greater degree of flexibility in payment for services, a useful factor for the poorest communities with irregular incomes. (Gaunt et al 2008)

Thirdly, presenting a single community voice to a decision-making agency has also proven to be an effective tool in achieving electricity connection for informal settlements, as well as ensuring the quality and suitability of the connection. Thorough data collection on the needs of a community pre-electrification is also vital, in tailoring the level of service to the needs of the community and their financial ability (Winayanti & Lang 2004, World Bank/ESMAP 2008, Fall et al 2008, Bravo, Kozulj & Landaveri 2008).

6. What technologies are used?

Solar energy, either in terms of photovoltaics for electricity generation or solar thermal for heating solutions, has not generally been a considered technology for peri-urban electrification or energy provision. Solar thermal water heaters have been considered as an energy replacement technology for public bathroom water heating in peri-urban areas of Accra, Ghana, but such systems have not yet been implemented (King, Ampornsah & Quansah 2012). Local generation can offer the possibility of return to the consumer from the utility through electricity sales, although solar is not considered a viable option for this in many peri-urban areas, due to the urban environment, and also the prohibitive expense of solar electricity in comparison to relatively readily-available grid electricity (Scott, Dunn & Sugden 2004).

The Cape Town City Council in partnership with the non-profit organisation SouthSouthNorth implemented the Kuyasa Income Urban Housing Energy Upgrade Project. This included solar water heaters as part of the retrofitting process performed under the project, along with efficient lighting and ceiling insulation (Clancy, Maduka & Lumampao 2008).

The predominant method used for informal settlement electrification in South Africa is grid connection, generally through a low- or medium-voltage distribution line (230 V – 11,000 V). Network design is determined by the layout and density of dwellings for the most part, and the After Diversity Maximum Demand (ADMD) per dwelling of the area. Department of Energy guidelines in South Africa state that a 20 Amp supply with a design ADMD of 0.8 – 1 kVA is suitable for new electrification projects. Some municipalities install 60 Amp systems immediately however, either for political reasons, or to minimise future visits by the utility for upgrade applications. Prepayment electricity meters are universally used, with measures taken such as using split-type meters to reduce tampering, as any theft on the connection cable is on the household side of the meter. (Gaunt et al 2008)

In both Mumbai and Delhi in India, the sole approach to a formal electricity connection in recent times has also been grid connection. This has raised numerous issues in terms of land security, security of tenure, and the relevant utility’s policies in terms of connection costs and repayment for electricity services (World Bank/ESMAP 2008).

7. EE measures

Energy efficiency measures have not been a common feature of informal settlement electrification programs in the majority of situations globally. As part of the COELBA Community Agent Electrification Project in Brazil, a local market for energy efficiency products and distribution/sales of
energy efficiency equipment (notably refrigerators) were included in the process of formalising electricity connection for the Barrio de Paz and Barrio Jardim da Mangabiera communities in Salvador. Both communities had high levels of electricity consumption through widespread inefficiencies, as well as high levels of illegal electricity connection. It was estimated in 2008 that the project saves between 26,000 and 44,000 MWh/year of energy, primarily from the refrigerator exchange program implemented as part of the project (World Bank/ESMAP 2008).

Supply-side efficiency with relevance to illegal connections is also rare, although a stated aim of the Turkish government’s electricity sector liberalisation program was to reduce non-technical losses in the electricity system by reducing illegal connections, and the government of Andhra Pradesh in India also experienced a noticeable drop in non-technical losses through electricity theft following privatisation of the state’s utility company (Tasdoven, Fiedler & Garayev 2012).
References

**Topic 1. Municipal Planning**

**Policy & Strategy**


Environmental & Health Planning


Energisation and Energy Transitions


Urban Design


Economic Measures and Modelling


### Topic 2. Municipal Waste and Energy

#### Sustainable Waste Management & Policy


Economic and Technical Models


Energy from MSW


**Topic 3. Transport**

**Sustainability in urban transport**


Policy and regulation for sustainable transport


Formalisation and user consultation


Urban form


**Modelling, indicators and frameworks**


**Socioeconomic effects of transport use**


**Topic 4. Buildings and Energy**
Socioeconomic analysis & policy


Topic 5. Electricity and Peri-Urban Energy

Financing & subsidies


Supply of Modern Energy Services


Dhingra et al. (2008) Access to clean energy services for the urban and peri-urban poor: a case study of Delhi, India. Energy for Sustainable Development, Vol. 12, No. 4, pp. 49 - 55


Formalisation of illegality in energy services


Energy efficiency


Li, Li & Qiu (2013) General Nexus Between Water and Electricity Use and Its Implication for Urban Agricultural Sustainability: A Case Study of Shenzhen, South China. Journal of Integrative Agriculture, Vol. 12, Iss. 8, pp 1341-1349


**Best practices**


Leduc & Van Kann (2013) Spatial planning based on urban energy harvesting toward productive urban regions. Journal of Cleaner Production, Vol. 39, pp 180-190

Scott, Dunn & Sugden (2003) Barriers to access to modern energy in slums. Gamos Ltd., Reading, United Kingdom

**Modelling**


Scott, Dunn & Sugden (2003) Barriers to access to modern energy in slums. Gamos Ltd., Reading, United Kingdom

Dhingra et al. (2008) Access to clean energy services for the urban and peri-urban poor: a case study of Delhi, India. Energy for Sustainable Development, Vol. 12, No. 4, pp. 49 - 55


